

ISE REFORM SEQUENCING TRACKER

BETA VERSION METHODOLOGY OVERVIEW – AUGUST 2020

Introduction

ISE’s Reform Sequencing Tracker is an ambitious endeavor to codify the sequence and performance of government reforms after periods of transition. To date, nearly 15,000 reform actions have been coded for over 20 countries: Rwanda, Afghanistan, Haiti, Serbia, Montenegro, Vietnam, Zimbabwe, Kosovo, Sri Lanka, Nicaragua, Mali, Kenya, Uzbekistan, Albania, Cambodia, Lesotho, Saudi Arabia, Tajikistan, Senegal, Moldova, Liberia, and Sudan.

Sequencing reforms is born out of necessity not preference – in an ideal scenario, leaders have unlimited resources to pursue the wide breadth of reforms that states in transition need. However, as we know, the realities of a post-conflict context require a series of difficult decisions. While extensive research exists on what reforms are needed – reconstruction, anti-corruption, reconciliation, etc. -- very little explores what sequence has proven successful. This project aims use data-driven research and qualitative interviews to determine what sequences we have seen in the past, what has worked in practice and what can be applied to the work of leaders, multilaterals and CSOs moving forward.

Objectives

This Reform Sequencing Tracker will examine the reform pathways that fragile and conflict-affected states have pursued for recovery and development. After periods of conflict or natural disaster, states must balance lofty ambitions and critical delivery, donor pressures and localized priorities, engrained institutional complexities and the need for transformation. The Tracker will consider how leaders have prioritized and sequenced reforms amidst the competing imperatives and the acute challenges of governing in a post-conflict context. What sort of factors have gone into leaders’ decision-making on these reform strategies? Appreciating that all contexts are different, what lessons can we draw about how leaders determine a reform strategy, how those strategies might be adopted, and how they are implemented?

The project endeavors to answer these questions in a two-prong approach: (1) the codification of data and information from official government documents, and (2) in-person interviews with those who contributed to reform development and implementation. The project has a number of important objectives:

- 1) Develop a better understanding of public sector management– including but not limited to the use of reform plans, strategic planning, resource distribution, incentive structures, communication, and visioning exercises;
- 2) Create a robust and multi-perspective dataset on qualitative aspects of reform to be used in the Reform Sequencing Project and the State Effectiveness Index;
- 3) Build ISE’s understanding of public sector management and reform sequencing by collecting lessons learned and best practices from those who directly managed reforms;
- 4) As useful, share the Reform Tracker data with government counterparts to demonstrate new perspectives of its reform trajectory, and potentially develop the functionality of reform management dashboards.

Outputs

In many cases, the visions of countries are presented in static PDF documents that are released on campaign trails but forgotten as time passes. The Reform Tracker codifies these documents into databases and presented in visual and usable dashboard formats to allow leaders to view how their lofty visions

have been manifested, progressed and changed over time. This depth of the information enables many uses. The following three outputs are the priority:

1. A searchable and multi-dimensional database of over 5,000 reform actions to provide a starting point for governments tackling similar priority areas
2. Visual analytics to research and understand the sequence of reforms over time and across different areas of government
3. Operational tool for governments to track the delivery of their reforms, manage the various efforts of the public sector, and provide accountability to the public.

Overview of Methodology

The project is the first of its kind to take static political documents and codify them in such a way as to analyze the sequence and performance of reforms.

Countries were chosen based on the following criteria:

- Countries had undergone a conflict or significant political instability between 1990-2010
- Countries who had created reform action strategies post-conflict through the World Bank or IMF, such as Poverty Reduction Strategy Reports, Visions, or Interim Cooperation Strategy Reports
- Countries whose strategy reports had clearly organized the sequence of reform actions, time frames, objectives, priorities, etc. In the form of a reform action matrix found in the annex of the document
- Countries whose conflicts and geographic locations were diverse

In coding this database, it was necessary that we design a methodology to consistently codify and categorize reform actions, as well as create a thorough taxonomy in order to analyze reform actions within and across countries. Reform documents were identified by the team, transcribed based on how it was written by government and codified across distinct features. This database was then coded to standardize and categorize reform actions based on country, priority, policy area, reform type, reform mechanism, and ISE functions of the state. Using this database, we can track the nature of the countries' reform sequence, analyze the success of countries' action sequences, and inform other post-conflict countries about next steps for their own reform sequences.

Reform actions are coded across a number of dimensions in order to capture a robust and multi-perspective view of the reform. The coding structure tags each reforms along the following elements:

- The What: What is the reform priority based on their own words? What is it trying to address?
- The How: How did it try to get towards its aims: a policy, a project or capacity building?
- The When: During what time period was the reform carried out? When did it begin? When did it end? At what phase of the larger reform journey was this planned for?
- The Why: What was the target of the reform?

The inclusion of in-person interviews aims to supplement the richness of data collected from online sources. It aims to capture the more opaque elements of the reform process, including but not limited to: the importance of a grand vision, the use of performance management, the longevity of reform language or terminology and more.

Taxonomy

The dataset uses a series of tags to add codify the reform actions and add depth to the database. A number of tags exist, but the key features are as follows:

Country-Level Tags: The first dimensions of the database are intended to capture the vision and strategy behind a particular reform action. Five areas are coded:

Vision	Strategy	Policy Matrix	Policy Area	Reform Action	Goal
The overarching aim for the reform created by a country to span a wide range of years and often multiple strategy documents	The strategy document mandated by the World Bank or IMF, often Poverty Reduction Strategy Reports	The theme for a Reform Action Matrix (ex. Economy, Agriculture, Social) much broader than Policy Area	The theme for reform actions. There are multiple Policy Areas within a Policy Matrix, and they encompass numerous Reform Actions.	The action or intervention undertaken by a country. This is the most granular level of data, or the data itself.	The goal as designated in a country's reform matrix.

Reform Priority: The thematic grouping of a reform action according to the country's own designated thematic priorities for reform, drawn from the country's guiding document or "vision." These labels are consistent across documents of the same country. For example, Rwanda's "Vision 2020" lays out six "Pillars," describing different themes of reform, including human resources and the private sector. Where a country does not explicitly label reforms under designated thematic priorities or "pillars", we use the country documents' descriptions of the thematic priorities to label the reforms, using the country's thematic intention as the guiding principle. Where countries do not explicitly designate thematic reform priorities or those priorities change between documents, we code according to the designated reform priorities from the guiding or most comprehensive document.

Reform Type: Each reform action is coded as one of three categorical types – capacity, policy, and project. Capacity reforms refer to interventions that are intended to address the internal structures and systems within the machinery of government. Policy reforms refer to interventions based in law or within the internal rules of government. Finally, project-based reforms aim to capture interventions that require the tangible building or revitalization of assets, including but not limited to, the construction of roads, the rehabilitation of schools and the technical improvement of the electrical grid.

Capacity	Policy	Project
Governmental capacity, institutional strengthening, institutional organization, service delivery	Policies, laws, strategies, plans, policy programs, and other governmental decrees. Especially those which may create broad-based change or have indefinite durations.	Projects, specific programs. Especially those which do not create broad-based change, but which are one attempt at carrying out specific change or have definite durations.

Reform Mechanism: Reforms are then coded into a mechanism within the appropriate type.

(Capacity)	(Policy)	(Project)
Review Preliminary gathering of information about a given subject. Usually the very first step, before designing a program. Specific to Capacity: review of the needs of	Review Preliminary gathering of information about a given subject. Usually the very first step, before designing a policy. Specific to Policy: review of existing policies	Review Preliminary gathering of information about a given subject. Usually the very first step, before designing a project. Specific to Project: review of existing projects broadly (not evaluating any

the population, demographics, poverty levels, etc.	and legislation broadly (not evaluating any policy in specific).	project in specific) or conducting feasibility studies.
Decrease Decrease the resources of the government within the existing organizational framework. Ex: reducing the number of employees without eliminating any organizational unit within the government; down-sizing, right-sizing.	Design Design or develop a policy, strategy, or plan, including consultations.	Design Design or develop a project.
Increase Increase the resources of the government within the existing organizational framework. Ex: increasing the number of employees without adding any organizational unit within the government; augmenting. (NOT building anything.)	Law Ratify or approve a law or legislation.	Pilot Pilot a project or launch a pilot.
Procedural Change Changing a procedure, especially a bureaucratic process, such as increasing or decreasing steps. The process can be within-government (changing the process of coordination or approval between governmental units) or society-facing (changing steps in processes for citizens or businesses seeking government approvals or benefits). (Distinct from Set Standards, more spec)	Implementation Any stage of the implementation of a policy, including the beginning of implementation, component steps, and/or completion.	Implementation Any stage of the implementation of a project, including the beginning of implementation, component steps, and/or completion.
Structural Change Changing the organizational structure within the government, such as changing the reporting lines or relationships between different governmental units. Units should stay the same. This also includes re-organizing responsibilities	Evaluation Retrospective, backward evaluation of a specific policy. Ex: Policy performance review, monitor progress on a specific policy.	Evaluation Retrospective evaluation of a specific project. Ex: Project performance review, M&E.
Establish Authority Creation of a new unit within the government, such as a new office or council.	Scale Scaling up or expanding a policy. Increase the people affected by a policy. Ex: Expand social protection programs, enrollment.	Scale Scaling up or expanding a project, especially expanding the number of people affected by a project.
Decentralisation Delegate certain national-level powers to more local levels of government.	Revision Revising or reforming a policy. "Implement reforms."	Rehabilitation Rehabilitating, repairing, or enhancing a project. Including "rehabilitate and construct" - defer to "rehabilitation." "Upgrade." "Improve."

Democracy Building Instituting, reforming, or reinforcing democratic institutions. Ex: Holding elections, setting up election commissions, developing a Constitution.	Publish Disseminate a policy or post it on a registry or online website.	Set Standards Ex. Building standards or codes
Finance Apportioning public funds. Ex: Establishing a fund, financing a policy or project, creating subsidies, creating or supporting financial products, etc.	Sensitisation Efforts to spread a message or best practices throughout the population, including awareness campaigns. Ex: Promote sanitary practices; raise awareness of citizens' rights or a certain law	
Train Training public workers.	Promotion To promote a policy goal, usually without specified mechanisms. "Support."	
Set Standards Set standards, government-facing. Setting the minimum requirement, standardized process. Procedural change with specific goal, introducing requirements. "Code of ethics." (Distinct from procedural change, more broad.)	International Engagement Bilateral or multilateral agreements, increased international trade	
Privatisation Turning over government entities or SOEs to the private sector. Ex: liquidation.		
Nationalisation Asserting government ownership over formerly-private equity. Ex: repossession, democratizing equity.		
Technology and Information Systems Employing technology and information systems, including internet and digitization, to improve government function. Ex: Instituting new government digital filing system, new online visa application portal, etc.		
Database Creating a database.		
Organizational Strengthening Institutional capacity. Catchall for institutional reforms		

Function of the State: The 10 "Functions of the State" were developed by ISE to thematically categorize reform actions. The 10 Functions include: Security, Rule of Law, Market Engagement, Infrastructure, Public

Finance, Governance/Public Sector Management, Human Capital, Asset Management, Citizen Engagement and Disaster Readiness.

Timeframe of Reform: The timing of reform actions are also analyzed based on three methods:

Calendar Years	Reform Plan Years	Phases
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Found in the Reform Action Matrix in a country's development strategy report • Comparable across countries • Target years by which countries should have completed individual reform actions 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Each reform document covers a range of years • Not comparable across countries • Speaks to the historical context of the country or the aim of certain administrations 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Not found in strategy documents • Calculated by dividing the range of reform years into thirds (Phase 1, 2,3) • Comparable across countries • Speaks to the phases of development, although without as much political context

In the case that a country did not specify the reform action targeted completion date, it was assumed that the completion date was the final year covered by the reform plan. This assumption is indicated in the database.

ISE Function of the State: Employs the 10 "Functions of the State" as developed by ISE to thematically categorize reform actions. Similar to "Reform Priority," except ISE determines the reform priorities, rather than individual countries. Thus, "Functions of the State" is a thematic categorization which allows for cross-country comparisons, while "Reform Priority," largely, does not.

Thematic Tags

"Equity" Used to designate reform actions which explicitly advance social equity. To qualify, reform actions must specifically mention a certain disadvantaged group/groups.

Code	Rule	Caveat
(Blank)	Action does not explicitly address social equity	
1	Action addresses social equity for women, people with disabilities, LGBTQ.	Actions targeted at "women and children" or "families" do not count because this comes too close to targeting the family unit, rather than women specifically, especially in non-traditional roles outside of the family.
2	Action addresses social equity for ethnic minorities.	Giving political autonomy to ethnic groups does not count. Actions in this category must explicitly advance an ethnic or racial minority within the framework of the larger society, such as African Americans in the USA, for example.
3	Conflict victims, or those targeted, marginalized, or otherwise harmed by recent conflicts.	Still deciding whether "reconciliation" and "national unity" are outside this scope.

"Open/Close": Used to designate reform actions which "open" or "close" the economy.

Theme	Open	Close
State ownership of the economy	(Reduce) Privatization, Liquidation	(Increase) Nationalization, Repossession
Foreign ownership of the economy	(Increase) Restrict indigenization	(Decrease) Require or promote indigenization, "democratize equity," etc.
Trade openness	(Increase) Lower import tariffs and duties. Reduce the number of quotas or increase quota amounts.	(Decrease) Increase import tariffs and duties. Increase the number of quotas or reduce quota amounts.

"ICT": Used to designate reform actions with increased use of Information and Communication Technology, availability of ICT, or expanded ICT infrastructure.

Annex: Description of each column

	Country	Vision	Strategy	Year	Reform Priority	Policy Matrix	Policy Area	Reform Action	Reform Type	Reform Mechanism
Required In Strategy Document?	✓		✓	✓	✓		✓	✓	✓	✓
	✓	✓	✓	✓	Sometimes; if not, this was coded	✓	✓	✓		
Coded Comparable across countries				✓					✓	✓
Definition	Post-conflict country chosen to analyze	Overarching development program for a country over a wide span of years	Reform strategy document	Span of years for the strategy document	Thematic grouping of reform actions based on countries' "pillars," continuous across strategy documents within countries	Theme for a series of Policy Areas that compose an entire Action Matrix	Theme for reform actions	The action or intervention undertaken by a country		
Example	Haiti	Vision 2030	Poverty Reduction Strategy Report	2014-2016	Rule of Law and Democracy	Institutional Reform	Develop awareness of gender in the judiciary	Establish special courts concerned with violence done to women, or appoint specialized judges	Capacity	Establish Authority

	Goal	End Year	Year Note	Phase	Function of the State	EQUITY	Open/Close	ICT	Ministry
Required Found in Strategy Document	✓	✓		✓	✓				
Coded Comparable across countries		✓		✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
Definition	The objective for a series of Reform Actions	Target year for the completion of the reform action	"This date was assumed based on the strategy end year" if no target year is documented	Phases of development, based only on years	ISE Function of the States	Thematic categorization of reform actions: inclusion of social, ethnic, or conflict equity	Thematic categorization of reform actions: open or close the economy	Thematic categorization of reform actions: inclusion/expansion of information and communication technology	Ministr(ies) responsible for implementing reforms
Example	Strengthen the administration of justice and public safety	2016		3	Rule of Law	Social			

Annex 2. Function of the State

Function of the State Taxonomy

Overview: In coding Function of the State, we apply the 10 Functions of the State as laid out in "Fixing Failed States" by Ashraf Ghani and Clare Lockhart, pages 124-166. Function of the State measures intent of the action, or thematic focus: the goal to which the action was intended to support.

1) Governance and Public Sector Management

- a) "Administrative control" page 131
 - "Bureaucracy" page 131
 - "Government professionals ... accountable to the citizenry ... recruited through an open process" page 131
 - "Unified body of rules and practices" page 131
 - "Tight adherence ... over time" especially in "frontiers and border points" page 132
- b) "Uniformity" "Standardization of practice" page 132
 - "Tolls [throughout a country]" page 132
 - "Time zones" page 132
- c) "Administrative units" page 131
 - "Specialized functions, has continuity over time, and is overseen at a higher level" page 131
 - "Synergize and coordinate" page 134

- d) Accountability
 - “Create public value” page 133
 - “Auditing, accounting, and procurement procedures that allow for internal and external oversight” page 133
 - “Modern governance technologies” page 133
 - “E-governance” page 134
 - “Citizen-centered governance” page 135
- e) Civil service
- f) Bureaucratic/administrative control
- g) SEARCH TERMS:
 - Construction of any government administrative building
 - “Civic Service”, “Civil Service”

2) Market Engagement

- a) “Setting and enforcing rules for commercial activity” page 149
 - “Establishment of standards for property rights (including intellectual property rights), banking, and insurance” page 150
 - “Sets standards for quality, enforces contracts, ... credible dispute resolution and arbitration mechanisms” page 150
 - “Defining the relationship between labor and capital” page 150
 - “Preventing monopolies” page 150
 - “Monitoring and regulating [global economic] flows” page 155
- b) “Supporting the operation and continued development of private enterprise” page 150
 - “Security of people and property, rule of law, education” page 150
 - “Building infrastructure” page 151
 - “Formation of direct alliances with private-sector players” page 151
 - “Use of tariffs” page 151
 - “Policies for the expansion of domestic products into foreign markets” page 151
 - “Dissemination of relevant state-generated research” page 151
 - “Agreements for the formalization of the globalized economy” page 151
 - Inferred: Ease of doing business, productivity
- c) “Intervening at times of market failure” page 150
- d) “Enabling mechanisms through which large segments of the population can participate in the market” page 153
 - “Mortgages, stock market” page 153
- e) SEARCH TERMS:
 - “taxes” “business” “SME” “Entrepreneurship”

3) Human Capital

- a) "Education" page 140
 - "Professions" page 140
 - "Universities," "university attendance" page 140
 - "Training of professional staff, future leaders, and administrators" page 142
- b) High-skill industry
 - "Skilled technology workers" page 143
 - "Specialized training programs" page 143
 - "Cluster of institutional relations" including "industry and centers of research" page 143
- c) "Public health" page 141
 - "Medicine" page 141
 - "Preventative health" page 141
 - "Health care" page 142

- Inferred: food security, housing
- d) SEARCH TERMS:
- “education” “health” “university”

4) Infrastructure Services

- a) "Transportation" page 147
- "Roads" page 148
 - (1) "Railroads" page 148
 - "Airports" page 148
 - (1) "Airlines" page 148
 - "Seaports" page 148
 - Water transport
 - (1) "Canals" page 148
 - (2) "Savings on transportation costs and flood damages" page 147
- b) "Power" page 147 (see c. below for hydro-power)
- "Electricity" page 148
- c) "Water management for irrigation and power" page 147
- "Turbine generators at the Hoover Dam produce a massive 2,074 megawatts of power" page 147
- d) "Communications" page 147
- "Telecom" page 148
 - "Communications highways" page 148
- e) "Pipelines" page 147
- f) "Technological research" page 147
- "the Internet" page 147
- g) "Health" infrastructure (page 148)
- "Sewage systems" page 148
 - "Clean water" page 148
 - "Sanitation" page 149
 - "Drinking water" page 149
 - Clinics and pharmacies do not count for Infrastructure - they instead fall under Human Capital. Page 148 makes a subtle distinction between "infrastructure services" ("sewage systems, clean water") and "other health services such as ... clinics and pharmacies". As such, those "other health services" more aptly fall under Human Capital.
- h) SEARCH TERMS:
- “ICT” “energy” “electricity” “telecommunications” “internet”
 - “airports” “seaports”
 - “Irrigation”/”sanitation”

5) Security, Law & Order

- a) “Monopoly over the means of destruction and the use of force” page 128
- b) “Legitimacy needed to subordinate violence to decision-making” page 128
- c) “Use of force, according to certain rules” page 128
- “Management system” page 129
 - “Police accountability” page 129
 - “Checks and balances on the use of force” page 130
- d) “Both human security and social security” page 129
- “Military” page 129
 - “Policing has become the face of order” page 129
 - “Public safety” page 130
- e) Inferred: Border control, national defense, territorial control
- f) SEARCH TERMS:

- “Border” “border posts”
- “police” “military”

6) Rule of Law

- a) “Law-making” page 125
 - “Limits of the state and the people” page 125
 - “Openness” in “the process for promulgating and changing rules” page 126
 - “Coherence” – “how laws relate to one another as a body of rules” page 126
- b) “Governance arrangements – decision rights, processes, accountabilities, freedoms, and duties” page 125
 - “Internal mechanisms to monitor each branch of the government” page 125
 - “Systematic checks and balances” page 125
- c) “Disputes are resolved through the process of law” page 125
 - Inferred: transitional justice – gacaca courts
- d) “Succession” of leadership page 127
- e) Inferred: Anti-corruption
- f) SEARCH TERMS:
 - “Corruption” “Asset declaration”
 - “Courts”
 - “Judicial”/”Judiciary”
 - “legislation” “law” “Parliament” “elections”

7) Asset Management

- a) "Allocation of rights to land and water" page 156
 - Land
 - "Land use" page 156
 - "Rights of private ownership" page 156
 - "User rights ... zoning" page 156
 - "Acquires private property for public purposes" page 156
- b) Water management
 - "Navigation on rivers and oceans" page 156
 - "Alternative uses of water" page 156
 - "Determining riparian rights" page 156
- c) "Sustainable use of natural capital" page 156
 - "Forests, rivers, seas, minerals" page 156
 - "Extractive industries" page 156
- d) "Mining" page 156
 - "Regimes of rights" page 157
 - "Rents" page 157
- e) "Management and protection of the environment" page 156
 - "Air and water pollution" page 157
 - "National park creation" page 157
 - "Species preservation" page 157
 - "Global warming" page 157
 - Inferred: green growth
 - Inferred: protecting "watershed"
- f) "Licensing of industrial and commercial activities" page 156
 - "Income from extractive industries" page 158
 - "Oil rents" page 158
 - "Transparent competitive process" page 158
- g) "Image or brand of the country" page 156

- "Cultural heritage" page 158
 - "Landscape" page 158
 - "[Cultural] products" page 158
 - Inferred: tourism, sports
- h) "Regional and global accounting systems" page 60
- "National accounts" page 159
- i) Not Asset Management
- "Harnessing rivers by means of dams and canals" page 156
 - Dams and canals are mentioned one time in this section, but it is never further explained or emphasized. The topic of dams and canals are significantly more emphasized in the Infrastructure section, so these are best categorized as Infrastructure.
 - "Within ... accounting systems will we be able to appreciate the use of assets such as *water, trade, and transport linkages*." page 160
 - This is the very last quote of this section, and the relevance of "water, trade, and transport linkages" is not further explained. Instead, these topics are explained and emphasized more in the Infrastructure section. The mention of these assets is more intended to illustrate the importance of accounting systems in management. As such, "water, trade, and transport linkages" are more aptly categorized as Infrastructure.
- j) SEARCH TERMS
- "Sports" "watersheds" "mining"
 - "Environment" "Solar Panels"
- 8) Disaster Readiness and Response**
- a) NO SECTION IN BOOK.
- b) SEARCH TERMS:
- "floods" "earthquake" "risk"
- 9) Public Finance: National Accountability Systems**
- a) "Management of public finances" page 135
- "Efficient collection" page 135
 - "Fewer major leakages" page 136
 - "Timely, systematized, and thus predictable fashion" page 137
 - "Allocation" page 135
 - "Expenditure" page 136
 - "Procurement" page 136
 - "Budgeting" page 136
 - "Efficiency ... an improvement in outcomes" page 136
 - "Block grants to villages across the country" page 139
 - "Treasury" page 136
- b) "Discipline of preparation, implementation, and alteration of budgets" page 136
- "Rules for the procurement of goods and services" page 136
 - "Accounting" page 136
 - "Auditing" page 136
 - "National accountability system" page 136
 - "Rule-directed disbursements" page 138
- c) "Changing mindsets by demonstrating the government's ability to manage monetary policy" page 138
- "Currency" page 138
- d) SEARCH TERMS:
- "Revenue" "leakages"
 - "budget" "debt"

10) Citizens Engagement & Participation

- a) "Creation of citizenship rights – social policies that cut across gender, ethnicity, race, class, spatial location, and religion" page 144
 - "Mainstreaming gender in social policy" page 146
 - "Immigrants ... the question of cultural identity vis a vis dominant cultural models" page 146
 - "regulating the working day and establishing minimum wages ... state intervened in the struggle between labor and capital" page 144
 - "Welfare mechanisms such as social security, pensions, disability, and child support ... safety nets to recognize especially vulnerable categories of citizens" page 144
 - "Credible social contract between the haves and the have-nots" page 146
 - Inferred: People with disabilities
- b) "National unity" page 144
 - "Consensus on citizenship rights" page 146
- c) SEARCH TERMS:
 - "Social protection" "social security" "subsidizing"